# SOME THOUGHTS ON THE GREEK MILIEU IN ROME IN RELATION TO THE CYRILLO-METHODIAN MISSION\*

## Martin HUSÁR\*

**Cuvinte-cheie:** Sf. Constantin-Cyril, Sf. Methodius, Roma medieval-timpurie, domeniul papal, greci, imperiul bizantin.

**Keywords:** St. Constantine-Cyril, St. Methodius, early medieval Rome, the Papal realm, Greeks, the Byzantine Empire.

Rezumat: Sfinții Constantin-Cyril și Methodius și discipolii lor, dintre care probabil făceau parte Sfinții Clement și Naum al Ohridei, au venit la Roma din Moravia în 867/8 – 869, iar apoi, Sf. Methodius a revenit din Panonnia și Moravia în 869 și 879/880. Principalul lor obiectiv era promovarea și apărarea liturgiei slavone în fața papei. Frații din Slonic, alături de discipolii lor, puteau coopera de asemenea cu comunitățile grecești stabilite în Roma. Trebuie subliniat că bisericile grecești, mănăstirile sau instituțiile caritabile erau întâlnite în mod obișnuit în Roma în acea perioadă. Autorul articolului încearcă să descrie statutul, modul în care erau percepuți și acceptați grecii și misiunea Cyrillo-Methodiană la Roma în secolul IX. Nu în ultimul rând, acesta încearcă să identifice trăsăturile comune dintre grecii din Roma și membrii de origine greacă ai misiunii amintite.

**Abstract:** Sts. Constantine-Cyril and Methodius and their disciples, to whom Sts. Clement and Naum of Ohrid most likely belonged to in Rome as well, came to Rome from Moravia in 867/8 – 869, and then, St. Methodius himself from Pannonia and Moravia in 869 and 879/880. Their main task and duty was to promote and defend the Slavonic liturgy before the Popes. The Salonica brothers with their retinue could also cooperate with or appear in the well-established Greek communities that were still in Rome at the time. It should be noted that Greek monasteries, convents, churches, or charitable

<sup>\*</sup> This work was supported by the Slovak Research and Development Agency under the contract No. APVV-16-0116 and by the Cultural and Educational Grant Agency of the Ministry of Education, Science, Research and Sport of the Slovak Republic under the contract No. 004UKF-4/2018.

<sup>\*\*</sup> Martin HUSÁR: Institute for Research of Constantine and Methodius' Cultural Heritage, Faculty of Arts, University of Constantine the Philosopher in Nitra, Štefánikova 67, 949 74 Nitra, Slovakia; e-mail: mhusar@ukf.sk.

institutions were nothing unusual there. The author of the paper tried to describe the situation in 9<sup>th</sup> century Rome in regard to the status, perception and acceptance of Greeks as well as the Cyrillo-Methodian mission there. Last but not least, he attempted to find something that Greeks and (the Greek) members of the given mission had in common there or where they could correlate with each other.

### Introduction

In the referred article I mainly try to find and examine possible mutual contact platforms, places or figures between the Greek milieu in Rome and the members of the Cyrillo-Methodian mission who were present there in the second half of the 9th century. The given topic has not been analysed satisfactorily yet, although some aspects of the topic were fragmentary investigated by various scholars. In this case I take into consideration only studies where various scholars dealt with both Greeks and the Salonica brothers (Sts. Constantine-Cyril and Methodius) in Rome. For example, Maddalena Betti, František Dvorník, Andrej Škoviera and Anthony-Emil N. Tachiaos mentioned the (strong) Greek presence, churches, or monasteries in early medieval Rome<sup>1</sup>. František Dvorník, Luděk Galuška and Miroslav Vaškových, Šimon Marinčák, and Vladimír Vavřínek noticed that Sts. Constantine-Cyril and Methodius probably stayed an unspecified time at the Monastery of St. Praxedes during their visit of Rome<sup>2</sup>. A possibility that the Salonica brothers attended a banquet, which was also organised for the Greek servants of God by Pope Hadrian II (867 - 872) in Rome on the 20th of February 868, considered the following scientists: Maddalena Betti, František Dvorník and Anthony-Emil N. Tachiaos<sup>3</sup>. Heinz Löwe explained the story of the Cyrillo-Methodian mission and at the same time he concentrated his attention on political and ecclesiastical relations between the Byzantine Empire and Papal Rome<sup>4</sup>.

## Perceiving of Greeks (in Rome)

During the (first) visit of the Salonica brothers in the Eternal City, between the year 867/8 and 869<sup>5</sup>, five of their disciples, along with St. Methodius himself, were ordained there. St. Methodius and three of them became priests and two other disciples became lectors<sup>6</sup>. *The Second Life of Naum of Ohrid* from the 16<sup>th</sup> century informs us only about two names regarding the above mentioned ordained disciples. They were future St. Clement of Ohrid as well as St. Naum of Ohrid whose ordinations (to the priesthood) might have taken place there, in

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> BETTI 2014, p. 74, 92; DVORNIK 1970, p. 134; ŠKOVIERA 2007, p. 118; TACHIAOS 1989, p. 115.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> DVORNIK 1970, p. 141; GALUŠKA & VAŠKOVÝCH 2013, p. 27; MARINČÁK 2005, p. 41; VAVŘÍNEK 2013, p. 167.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> BETTI 2014, p. 92, n. 164; DVORNIK 1970, p. 138; TACHIAOS 1989, p. 115, 118.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> LÖWE 1983, p. 631-686.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> St. Methodius came to Rome twice yet. He met Pope Hadrian II in 869 and Pope John VIII (872-882) in 879/880. *Industriae tuae*, p. 163-173; *Žitije Mefodija, archijepiskopa Moravuska* VIII, p. 130.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Žitije Mefodija, archijepiskopa Moravvska VI, p. 126. The ordination was carried out by Bishops Formosus (the future Pope in 891 – 896) and Gauderich of Velletri (the probable author of the Roman Legend). Žitije Konstantina Filosofa XVII, p. 90-91.

Rome<sup>7</sup>. Both of them probably came from Moesia<sup>8</sup> which points to the former Roman territories in present-day Bulgaria and Serbia. At least St. Clement of Ohrid had most likely been a long-term fellow of St. Methodius since his early youth<sup>9</sup>, as we know it from the so called *Long Life of St. Clement of Ohrid* or the *Bulgarian Legend* that was compiled by Theophylact of Ohrid between the end of the 11<sup>th</sup> century and the beginning of the 12<sup>th</sup> century<sup>10</sup>. Although both disciples might have been Slavs, they could initially reside in the milieu which was close to the Byzantine Empire or as literates they were well familiar with the Greek language<sup>11</sup>.

Sts. Clement and Naum of Ohrid, as well as their masters, Sts. Constantine-Cyril and Methodius, who were natives of Byzantine Thessaloniki, were probably, at least in the eyes of inhabitants of Rome, seen as Greeks, or as people living in Byzantium or the Eastern Mediterranean. The adjective or noun Gr(a)ecus also referred in medieval Latin, in addition to the ethnical Greeks, to all non-Latin speakers from the Christian East who were Greeks culturally  $^{12}$ .

First, I should explain how the Byzantines/Greeks perceived themselves in the examined period and then how they were perceived by the Latin West, particularly in the Frankish Empire and the Papal realm. In this case the 9<sup>th</sup> century comes into my primary focus.

The process of *translatio imperii* that ended in the establishment of the Eastern Roman/Byzantine Empire based on two elements – its Emperor and the capital, Constantinople – started between the reign of Emperor Constantine I (306 – 337) with his transfer of the Roman capital from the City of Rome to the City of Constantinople and the termination of the Western Roman Empire<sup>13</sup>. The late Roman idea of the Empire or Romanness was bound up with the idea of an imperial territory without limits, where the two aforementioned solid elements should have existed. This empire had got several denominations in the East:  $P\omega\mu\alpha\acute{\iota}\omega\nu$   $\pio\lambda\iota\tau\acute{\iota}\alpha$ ,  $P\omega\mu\alpha\acute{\iota}\omega\nu$   $d\rho\chi\acute{\eta}$ ,  $P\omega\mu\alpha\acute{\iota}\omega\nu$   $\beta\alpha\sigma\iota\lambda\acute{\iota}\alpha$ , or  $P\omega\mu\alpha\acute{\iota}\alpha^{14}$ . Facts from the Taktika of Byzantine Emperor Leo VI (886 – 912), which was compiled in the early  $10^{th}$  century, should be still valid for the  $9^{th}$  century. The author of the Taktika stated there that the neighbouring Saracens, as Persians before, harmed the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Žitije Nauma (II), p. 227.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> The aforementioned Second Life of Naum of Ohrid mentions that St. Naum originated in Moesia. Žitije Nauma (II), p. 226. According to the so called Short Life of St. Clement or the Ohrid Legend, which was written at the beginning of the 13<sup>th</sup> century by Demetrios Chomatianos, St. Clement of Ohrid came "...from the European Moesians who many people know as Bulgarians..." The Ohrid Leged 1, p. 316-317.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> *Βίος Κλήμεντος* ΧΧΙΙ, 65; p. 208.

 $<sup>^{10}</sup>$  Additional literature in relation to this biography you can find mentioned here: HUSÁR 2017, p. 95, n. 8.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup>OBOLENSKY 1988, p. 11-12; ŠKOVIERA 2010, p. 111, 121.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> GANTNER 2013, p. 313; GOODSON 2010, p. 188.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> MASKARINEC 2013, p. 352; STOURAITIS 2017, p. 72. In the time of Marcus Tullius Cicero (106 – 43 BC) the conception of Romanness mainly regarded yet the Roman citizenship. *Ciceronis de Legibus* II, 5; p. 194-195; MASKARINEC 2013, p. 352. Since Late Antiquity instead of Roman *cives* of the previous centuries the term *subjectus* had been used for everybody under the imperial authority. STOURAITIS 2014, p. 184-185.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> STOURAITIS 2017, p. 73.

subjects of the Emperor within the borders of their (/the subjects') commonwealth <sup>15</sup>. That refers to the shift in the stated imperial paradigm towards the paradigm of the empire with (fluctuating) borders <sup>16</sup>. It should be stressed that Byzantines called themselves in the  $9^{th}-10^{th}$  centuries literary sources as Romans ( $P\omega\mu\alpha\hat{i}ot$ ) in the political sphere, but in the cultural sphere they rather used the Latin calque  $\Gamma\rho\alpha\kappaot$ . By contrast, Byzantines usually avoided denoting themselves by the word  $E\lambda\lambda\eta\nu\epsilon\zeta$  because since the beginning of the Eastern Roman Empire it had been associated with non-Christian ancestors of Greeks or their contemporaries. Nonetheless, during the Macedonian Renaissance, which started in the  $9^{th}$  century, the term  $E\lambda\lambda\eta\nu$  was neutrally related to the language and literature of Antique Greece as well <sup>17</sup>. After the  $7^{th}$  century the common language of the subjects of the Eastern Roman/Byzantine Empire was Greek <sup>18</sup>. And subjects, who wanted to obtain full rights in legal and political system of the Empire (since the second half of the  $5^{th}$  century), had to be Chalcedonian Christians <sup>19</sup>.

Since the middle of the 8th century the Popes had started to form de facto their own state or republic<sup>20</sup>, which was independent from the Byzantine Empire, whose power was fading away at the time and was ruled by Emperor Constantine V (741 – 775)<sup>21</sup>. It should be stressed that between 678 and 772 there were 12 Popes of eastern and Greek origins in Rome out of 16, mainly Syrians, Greeks and Sicilians<sup>22</sup>. The Pontiff Stephen II (752 – 757), who had Roman origins, formed an alliance with the Frankish Kingdom in 753/754, because the Byzantine Empire did not provide a sufficient military support and endorsed iconoclasm<sup>23</sup>. But it was Pontiff Hadrian I (772 - 795, he was of Roman origins too) who eventually separated the former Roman duchy from Byzantium around 775 and started to issue his own coins<sup>24</sup>. Due to these issues and the eventual final split the Latin word *Gr*(a)*eci* somehow became slightly pejorative in Rome and it clearly began to denote an eastern ethnic or cultural identity, which was different from that of Rome (Romani in Latin). Clemens Gantner recently considered the beginning of this trend in the course of the pontificates of Pope Stephen II and Paul I (757 -767, he was of Roman origins as well), but firmly during the rule of Pope Hadrian

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> Leonis VI Tactica 18, 135; p. 488-489.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> STOURAITIS 2017, p. 73.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> GANTNER 2013, p. 305; RAPP 2008, p. 139-140; POHL 2012, p. 7. During the period of Macedonian dynasty and renaissance (867 – 1056) Byzantine Emperors or literati glorified the pre-iconoclastic past of Late Antiquity. BOLLÓK 2016, p. 73-74.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> STOURAITIS 2014, p. 185, 202.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> GREATREX 2000, p. 278; STOURAITIS 2017, p. 75.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> They were able to withstand the Lombards and Byzantines' pressure only with the assistance of the Frankish rulers, namely Pippin III (747 – 768) and Charlemagne (768 – 814). GANTNER 2014a, p. 136-138. The Papal republic had got the following designation: *sancta Dei ecclesiae reipublicae Romanorum* and other variations of this name. NOBLE 1991, p. 96.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> NOBLE 1991, p. 94-137.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> GANTNER 2013, p. 314, 341, Table 1; KRAUTHEIMER 2000, p. 90.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> GANTNER 2013, p. 311; GANTNER 2014b, p. 462.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> GANTNER 2013, p. 330; GANTNER 2014b, p. 462, 464

I<sup>25</sup>. In the Frankish milieu the term Gr(a)eci had not been used for subjects of the Byzantine empire negatively until the 9<sup>th</sup> century when it changed<sup>26</sup>.

## Greeks and their space within Rome

Except of numerous merchants and settlers, whose descendants had stayed in Rome since the Roman Empire and the early Eastern Roman/Byzantine presence in Italy, many Greeks or other refugees from the former Eastern Roman or Byzantine territory (also from Southern Italy and Sicily) came to Rome after the Persian and Arab invasions<sup>27</sup>. Some Greeks might have fled the Byzantine Empire during the monothelite (638 - 680) and iconoclastic (726 - 787, 815 - 843) controversies too<sup>28</sup>.

They were not only laymen among Greeks, but also monks. The latter established the first Eastern monasteries in the city. In the subsequent lines I particularly mention monasteries and convents where the Greek or eastern monks and nuns were settled even in the 9th century. The important list of the seven Greek monasteries in Rome is presented in the biography of Pope Leo III (795-816), because they were donated by him in 807. They are: St. Saba's monastery, St. Anastasius the martyr's monastery, St. Andrew's monastery in Clivus Scauri, St. Agatha the martyr's monastery over the Subura, St. Erasmus' monastery on the Caelian Hill, St. Silvester's monastery and the Monastery of Renatus with St. Lucy's oratory<sup>29</sup>. Also the Greek convent – St. Gregory's oratory in the Campus Martius – should be noticed for the year 807<sup>30</sup>.

Already in 649 Monasterium de Cilicia qui ponitur in Aquas Salvias (the aforementioned St. Anastasius the martyr's monastery) existed outside the Aurelian walls. It formerly belonged to the monks from the Jerusalem area<sup>31</sup> or Cilicia<sup>32</sup> and another account from the course of the 7<sup>th</sup> century mentions the head of St. Anastasius which was venerated there<sup>33</sup>. Then for the 9<sup>th</sup> century I know about five papal donations for this monastery, from which the last one was made by Pope Nicholas I (858 – 867)<sup>34</sup>.

Pope Donus (676 – 678) found out that the Syriac monks from the monastery called Boetiana (at the unknown place) are the Nestorians and then he subsequently divided them and sent to other monasteries of Rome. Finally, Pope Donus brought Roman (Latin) monks to the given monastery<sup>35</sup>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> GANTNER 2014a, p. 136-137; GANTNER 2014b, p. 469.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> GANTNER 2013, p. 306-307, 307, n. 20.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> GANTNER 2015, p. 246; MICHEL 1952, p. 32-33.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> For instance, future Constantinopolitan Patriarch Methodius I (843 – 847) was a monk in Rome from 815 to 821 where he fled due to the reign of iconoclastic Emperors in Byzantium. GANTNER 2014a, p. 99, 137.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> Vita Leonis III, Liber Pontificalis 98: 76, 79; p. 212, 215; MASKARINEC 2014, Table 1; SANSTERRE 1983a, p. 32-37.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> Vita Leonis III, Liber Pontificalis 98: 80; p. 217.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> MASKARINEC 2014, p. 27.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> FERRARI 1957, p. 39.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> FERRARI 1957, p. 39.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> Vita Nicolai I, Liber Pontificalis 107, 36; p. 221.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> Vita Doni, Liber Pontificalis 80; p. 73.

St. Saba's monastery (upon the Aventine Hill) was the follower of the previous (Latin) monastery called the *Cella nova* and it was founded by the mother of St. Gregory the Great – St. Silvia<sup>36</sup>. Since the (late) 7<sup>th</sup> century it had been staffed by the monks from the Monastery of St. Saba in Jerusalem or maybe from the North African Sabaite community<sup>37</sup>. The Greek or eastern character of the monastery is well documented by burial inscriptions from the 7<sup>th</sup> to the 9<sup>th</sup> century under the monastery's church<sup>38</sup>. Abbot Peter from this monastery was one of the two papal legates sent to the seventh ecumenical council, the Council of Nicaea, in 787<sup>39</sup>. The given abbot was most likely familiar with the Greek language. The Order of St. Benedict took the monastery in the 10<sup>th</sup> century<sup>40</sup>.

Between the end of the 6<sup>th</sup> century/the 7<sup>th</sup> century and the year 897 the Greek monks resided in the St. Erasmus' monastery on the Caelian Hill<sup>41</sup>. Two of their abbots from the 9<sup>th</sup> century were also officials of the Church in Rome and the Papal court, namely Abbot Nicholas was a bishop and Zachary a *scriniarius*<sup>42</sup>.

The Monastery of Renatus<sup>43</sup> was formerly (certainly already in 649) composed of the Armenian monks (probably hellenised)<sup>44</sup> who most likely ceased to be stationed there in the course of the time. That might have happened sometime in the 9<sup>th</sup> century and they were changed for the Latin monks<sup>45</sup>. Jean-Marie Sansterre<sup>46</sup> guessed that the lack of diversification in the recruitment of new monks could cause the decline of the former community in the monastery.

Jean-Marie Sansterre admitted that St. Agatha the martyr's monastery (probably between the Viminal and Esquiline Hills) was a Greek monastery  $^{47}$ . Although it was newly founded in 715/731 by Pope Gregory II (715 – 731), the account from his biography does not provide any additional information in relation to the origin of monks who resided there  $^{48}$ . The end of the monastery is not clear as well. St. Agatha the martyr's monastery does evidently not appear in the primary literary sources of the  $10^{\text{th}}$  century  $^{49}$ .

St. Andrew/Gregory's monastery in Clivus Scauri (on the Coelian Hill) certainly belonged to the Greek monks approximately from about 750 to the 9th century. In the time of Pope Nicholas I the last (Greek) hegumenus Zacharias lead the monastery. Then there had been no information about Greeks until the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> MICHEL 1952, p. 39.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> MASKARINEC 2014, p. 27.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> FERRARI 1957, p. 283-284.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> GANTNER 2015, p. 255; NOBLE 2009, p. 160.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup> WEHRENS 2016, p. 328.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> FERRARI 1957, p. 119-127; MICHEL 1952, p. 38-39.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup> FERRARI 1957, p. 120, 125, 129.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>43</sup> Its location is uncertain, but it was most likely located somewhere upon the Esquiline Hill and close to the Porta Maggiore/Prenestina; FERRARI 1957, p. 280; SANSTERRE 1988, p. 704.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>44</sup>SANSTERRE 1988, p. 704.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>45</sup> FERRARI 1957, p. 278-280; MASKARINEC 2014, Table 1; SANSTERRE 1983a, p. 32-37, 105-106, n. 400 and p. 208.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>46</sup>SANSTERRE 1983a, p. 48.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>47</sup>SANSTERRE 1983a, p. 34.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>48</sup> Vita Gregorii II, Liber Pontificalis 91, 10; 9; FERRARI 1957, p. 19; SANSTERRE 1983a, p. 49.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>49</sup>SANSTERRE 1983a, p. 208.

return of the Latin monks in the early 10<sup>th</sup> century<sup>50</sup>. John the Deacon (a monk and deacon) wrote *the Life of Gregory the Great* in 873 – 876. This biography bears animosity towards foreigners as Greeks were. John the Deacon even regrets that the Monastery of St. Andrew was seized by the Greek monks and looks forward to the return of the monastery back to the hands of the Latin monks<sup>51</sup>.

The St. Silvester's monastery, which had formerly been dedicated to Sts. Stephen and Silvester, was set up by Pope Paul I at his home estate (northern Rome) in 761. He entrusted a community of monks with the chanting of the psalms in the Greek manner (*Graeca modulatio*) there<sup>52</sup>. They also kept various relics there and from the 8<sup>th</sup> to the 10<sup>th</sup> century the referred monastery received a lot of papal possessions and donations inside and outside Rome. It is unclear when the Greek monks were replaces by the Latin ones<sup>53</sup>.

There is a possibility that the Greek monks resided in St. Mary's monastery on the Capitoline Hill already in the  $8^{th}$  century. The shaky proof for that is based only on a marble slab with the (incomplete) engraved inscription containing the word  $HFOYMENO\Sigma$  in the Greek alphabet<sup>54</sup>. This slab was found at the monastery's estate in 1892. On the basis of the  $10^{th}$  century primary literary sources Guy Ferrari supposed that the Latin monks were present in this monastery at least from the middle of the  $10^{th}$  century on<sup>55</sup>.

Pope Paschal I (817 – 824) commissioned to build a monastery nearby the Church of St. Praxedes the martyr in 818/819<sup>56</sup>, where he appointed Greeks to celebrate God in their language<sup>57</sup>. The monastery of St. Praxedes was so close<sup>58</sup> to the Basilica of St. Mary Major (and on the Esquiline Hill). In this basilica Hadrian II consecrated the Slavonic liturgical books brought by the Cyrillo-Methodian mission on the first day of their celebration in 867/8. Except for two short accounts concerning donations for this monastery by Pontiffs Gregory IV (828 – 844) and Leo IV (847 – 855) we have not got any other accounts of the monastery during the 9<sup>th</sup> century<sup>59</sup>. As I have already mentioned before, some scholars assumed that the Salonica brothers were probably accommodated during their stay in Rome right in this monastery<sup>60</sup>, even though there is no evidence for that. František

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>50</sup> FERRARI 1957, p. 146-147, 151.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>51</sup> Sancti Gregorii magni vita IV, 82; p. 229; COSTAMBEYS & LEYSER 2007, p. 286.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>52</sup> Vita Pauli I, Liber Pontificalis 95, 5; p. 82-83.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>53</sup> FERRARI 1957, p. 312.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>54</sup> FERRARI 1957, p. 210.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>55</sup> FERRARI 1957, p. 212-213.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>56</sup> DAVIS 1995, p. 10.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>57</sup> Pontiff Paschal I "...gathered a holy community of the Greeks, which he placed therein to carry out carefully by day and night praises to almighty God and his saints resting therein, chanting the psalms in the Greek manner." Vita Paschalis I, Liber Pontificalis 100: 9, p. 11. Paschal's positive attitude towards Greeks can be demonstrated also on his granting of asylum for them during the reign of an iconoclastic Emperor Michael II (820 – 829) in Byzantium. GOODSON 2010, p. 12.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>58</sup> Approximately 180 meters in a beeline to the Basilica of St. Mary Major; FERRARI 1957, plan IV.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>59</sup> FERRARI 1957, p. 8.

<sup>60</sup> DVORNIK 1970, p. 141; GALUŠKA & VAŠKOVÝCH 2013, p. 27; MARINČÁK 2005, p. 41; VAVŘÍNEK 2013, p. 167.

Dvorník stated that Anastasius the Librarian (ca. 811/812 – 879)<sup>61</sup>, who was most likely a friend of St. Constantine-Cyril<sup>62</sup> and the important member of the papal secretariat during the reign of tree Popes (Nicholas I, Hadrian II, and John VIII)<sup>63</sup>, could have had a good relationship with this monastery and he could learn the Greek language here<sup>64</sup>.

The Monastery of St. Caesarius on the Palatine Hill was most probably mentioned for the first time in 825 in conjunction with foreign Monk Basil. He, along with his four disciples, was accommodated on the Palatine Hill and the Greek monks were present there as well<sup>65</sup>. The interesting story contains *The Life of Blasius from Amorion* (Phrygia, Asia Minor). St. Blasius had come to Rome with the Bulgarian envoys in 866, then spent 18 years in the referred monastery of St. Caesarius, subsequently he moved again to the Monastery of Stoudios in Constantinople, and finally to Mount Athos where he died about 910<sup>66</sup>.

During the pontificate of Pope Leo IV another Greek monastery  $^{67}$ , named after St. Stephen and Cassius, was restored from two abandoned Latin monasteries in the vicinity of the Basilica of St. Lawrence outside the Walls  $^{68}$ . These two monasteries bore the name of St. Stephen and Cassius as well. The incomplete inscription (in the Greek alphabet) in the ambo of the St. Lawrence's Basilica, which can be dated to the second half of the  $9^{th}$  century, contains the name of the  $\mathring{\eta}\gammao\mathring{\nu}\mu\epsilon\nuo\varsigma$   $\mathring{A}\rho\sigma\acute{\epsilon}\nu\iotao\varsigma$ . Finally, in the  $10^{th}$  century the monastery started to host the Latin monks $^{70}$ .

The Greek convent, which can be identified with the St. Gregory's oratory in the Campus Martius, received the donation of a silver canister by Pope Leo III in 807. By the *Subiaco Register* (the year 937) we can state the following. The convent might already have been established by Pope Zacharias (741 – 752) for iconodule nuns (from the Convent of St. Anastasia in Constantinople) who fled the Byzantine Empire and brought the relics of St. Gregory of Nazianzus to the aforementioned oratory in Rome<sup>71</sup>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>61</sup> He was the admirer of the Greek language and its translator as well. TACHIAOS 1989, p. 111. According to Tibor Živković Anastasius could have been a half-Greek because of his mother's alleged Greek origin. ŽIVKOVIĆ 2012, p. 222.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>62</sup> Anthony-Emil N. Tachiaos wrote that St. Constantine-Cyril came to know Roman ecclesiastical figures via him. TACHIAOS 2002, p. 215.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>63</sup> DVORNIK 1970, p. 139-140.

<sup>64</sup> DVORNIK 1970, p. 141.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>65</sup> Translatio et miracula sanctorum Marcellini et Petri I, 5, p. 242.

<sup>66</sup> FERRARI 1957, p. 88-90; MICHEL 1952, p. 34-35.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>67</sup> GANTNER 2014a, p. 99. Pope Leo IV "...decorated it opulently with gifts and riches. In it he established many monks of Greek race and of holy behaviour, who might fulfil day and night by the praises to almighty God and that martyr (St. Lawrence)." Vita Leonis IV, Liber Pontificalis 105: 30; p. 123.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>68</sup> Vita Leonis III, Liber Pontificalis 98: 77, p. 214.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>69</sup> DUCHESNE 1892, p. 436, n. 20.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>70</sup> FERRARI 1957, p. 187-189.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>71</sup> Vita Leonis III, Liber Pontificalis 98: 80, p. 217; DAVIS 1992, p. 217, n. 166; FERRARI 1957, p. 207-209.

Except for monasteries, there were also other institutions, which were run by consecrated persons who lived monastic life as well<sup>72</sup>. First of all, there were diaconiae – charitable institutions which helped the poor of Rome or foreign origin with food and baths<sup>73</sup>. The first of these organisations had probably been founded in Rome (with help from the Popes) in the 80s of the 7th century74. Xenodochia and hospitalia were institutions which provided the similar services as diaconiae. First of them provided food and health care for the indigent and sick people and the latter offered food and perhaps also accommodation for pilgrims and some local people<sup>75</sup>. Because more than half of institutions from the all three aforementioned kinds of charitable institutions were dedicated in the year 807 to foreign saints from the eastern Mediterranean or lands in the east of this sea76, it should be supposed that some of them might be connected with the Greek or Eastern milieu<sup>77</sup>. Charitable monasteries, like xenodochia and diaconiae, had already started in Egypt during the 4th century and were well known also in Constantinople since the late 4th century - early 5th century. Throughout the 9th century xenodochia and diaconiae, as we knew them from the previous centuries, ceased to exist and in the same time non-primarily charitable monasteries of the Benedictine order spread in Rome<sup>78</sup>.

Some scholars reckoned that during the time of the Pontiffs of eastern and Greek origins in Rome there were about 40%<sup>79</sup> (or even more)<sup>80</sup> of easterners among the population of the city. Greek communities were particularly settled in the lowland area between the River Tiber and the Capitoline, Palatine, and Aventine Hills (at their feet), which was called *Velabrum* and primarily served as a commercial and port neighbourhood even during the time of ancient Rome<sup>81</sup>. The Greek character of this area was underlined yet in the 10<sup>th</sup> century by its name *ripa Graeca*<sup>82</sup>. Also upon the Palatine Hill the centre for deputies (*duces*) of the Byzantine emperors formerly had existed after the first half of the 6<sup>th</sup> century<sup>83</sup>. Then in the course of the 8<sup>th</sup> century, when the political situation had changed, they started to be deputies of the Pope<sup>84</sup>. The S. Maria in Cosmedin/*diaconia sanctae Mariae qui vocatur Cosmidi*<sup>85</sup> with a small church is one of the *diaconiae* from *Velabrum*, which were most likely built after the Gothic wars in part of the former administrative complex (*statio annonae*). This complex distributed free grain to the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>72</sup> DEY 2008, p. 410-411.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>73</sup> DEY 2008, p. 408.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>74</sup> DEY 2008, p. 400; MASKARINEC 2018, p. 86.

<sup>75</sup> DEY 2008, p. 408.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>76</sup> MASKARINEC 2014, Table 1-3.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>77</sup> MASKARINEC 2014, p. 22-26.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>78</sup> DEY 2008, p. 409, 413, 420-421. These two kinds of institutions were then altered by foreign *scholae* and the remaining *hospitalia*. DEY 2008, p. 409, 422.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>79</sup> GANTNER 2013, p. 315.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>80</sup> EKONOMOU 2007, p. 247.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>81</sup> DVORNIK 1970, p. 134; TACHIAOS 1989, p. 115; BATIFFOL 1888, p. 297; MASKARINEC 2014, p. 28; MASKARINEC 2018, p. 76, 93, map 7.

<sup>82</sup> MASKARINEC 2018, p. 93.

<sup>83</sup> WEHRENS 2016, p. 292.

<sup>84</sup> MASKARINEC 2018, p. 93-94.

<sup>85</sup> KRAUTHEIMER, FRANKL & CORBETT 1959, p. 279.

citizens of the city of Rome already in the 1st century AD. The name of the given diaconia is probably connected with the Κοσμίδιον monastery in Constantinople, where the sick were healed without an admission fee86. The church of this diaconia was even enriched (apart from renovation) by the construction of an oratory, triclinium and a papal residence during the Pontificate of the Nicholas I87. Since the late 8th or early 9th century the schola Graecorum had been stationed in the neighbourhood of Velabrum and right nearby the church of S. Maria in Cosmedin<sup>88</sup>. As other scholae of foreign nations<sup>89</sup>, the schola Graecorum protected and helped (Greek) pilgrims or visitors 90. This schola is mentioned in the primary literary sources in regard to Rome also in the late 9th century and in the time of the end of the 10th century and the beginning of the 11th century<sup>91</sup>. The significance of the schola Graecorum in the end of the 9th century can be documented by one account from the Annals of Fulda. Having Eastern Frankish King Arnulf defeated supporters of his distant cousin Berengar in Rome and occupied this city in 896, the senate of Romans and the Graecorum schola gave him a pompous welcome on the Milvian Bridge and accompanied him to his imperial coronation which gave him Pope Formosus (891 – 896) in the Basilica of St. Peter<sup>92</sup>.

There were also other *diaconiae* with churches in the referred quarter that can be linked with the Byzantine officers or officials from the Palatine Hill (S. Maria Antiqua/diaconia...Dei genetricis quae appellatur Antiqua)<sup>93</sup> or their patron saints originated in the eastern parts of the former Roman Empire (S. Giorgio al Velabro/diaconia beati Georgii<sup>94</sup>, diaconia in ecclesia Sancti Nicolai in Carcere<sup>95</sup>, S. Teodoro/diaconia sancti Theodori)<sup>96</sup>.

It can be added that the Chapel of St. Andrew and the Basilica of St. Paul, which Sts. Constantine-Cyril and Methodius visited on the third day of the Slavonic liturgy celebration (867/868), could have had a certain special symbolic

<sup>86</sup> MASKARINEC 2018, p. 78; WEHRENS 2016, p. 329.

<sup>87</sup> Vita Nicolai I, Liber Pontificalis 107: 16, 52; p. 211, 232.

<sup>88</sup> MASKARINEC 2014, p. 28; MASKARINEC 2018, p. 96.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>89</sup> IZZI 2010, p. 103-106. MASKARINEC 2018, p. 96. There were *scholae* of Franks, Frisians, Lombards, and (Anglo-)Saxons as well and they were close to the Vatican. In addition to their other tasks, they should have defended the city of Rome and Porto too. Anglo-Saxons gave the current name (Borgio) to the quarter around the Basilica of St. Peter by the use of their word *burh* (*burgus* in Latin) for this territory in 817. IZZI 2010, p. 105, 105, n. 9.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>90</sup> MASKARINEC 2018, p. 96.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>91</sup> MASKARINEC 2018, p. 97.

<sup>92</sup> Annales Fuldenses, 896; p. 128.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>93</sup> This *diaconia* was mentioned yet in the time of Pope Leo III and it should be noted that its church was abandoned in 847 (after an earthquake), during the pontificate of Leo IV. KRAUTHEIMER, FRANKL & CORBETT 1959, p. 250; WEHRENS 2016, p. 293.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>94</sup> There were also found Greek epitaphs from the time of Pontiff John VIII (872 – 882). KRAUTHEIMER 1937, p. 245.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>95</sup> It was well known in the late 8th century yet. MASKARINEC 2018, p. 90-93; ORLENDI 1731, p. 513.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>96</sup> KRAUTĤEIMER, CORBETT & FRANKL 1970, p. 279. The given *diaconia* is mentioned for the last time in the 9<sup>th</sup> century in relation to a textile donation made by Pope Gregory IV. *Vita Gregorii IV, Liber Pontificalis* 103, 15; p. 57.

meaning. The aforementioned chapel and the basilica somehow could represent the Byzantine presence in Rome. St. Andrew was one of the Constantinopolitan patron saints. A chapel dedicated to him might be perceived as an attempt to transfer St. Andrew's veneration to Rome. Its building was commissioned by Pope Symmachus (498 – 518) in the former mausoleum situated beside the Basilica of St. Peter. The veneration of St. Andrew in Rome as in Constantinople was associated with the veneration of St. Thomas. First, relics of both saints were housed in the so called Apostoleion (The Shrine of the Apostles) which construction was ordered by Constantine I and completed in 336. In Roman St. Andrew's Chapel there was the main altar placed in the central niche and dedicated to St. Andrew and one of the lateral altars was devoted to St. Thomas 97. St. Paul brought the Christian religion to Thessaloniki and this town was the birthplace of the Salonica brothers. This saint was also perceived as the *apostolus gentium* or *magister gentium* and this could carry a supportive message for the Cyrillo-Methodian mission too 98.

### The portrait of St. Cyril in the Basilica of St. Clement

In the subsequent lines of the text I deal with Constantine-Cyril's appearance on the basis of murals from the Basilica of St. Clement. Also this example can show how significant the influence of the Byzantine cultural and artistic milieu in Rome was during the referred period.

The personal appearance of Sts. Constantine and Methodius and the way of their clothing during their presence in Rome is still not resolved and it is unlikely to ever be solved in a satisfactory manner. Apart from the later (the 11<sup>th</sup> century) depictions of Sts. Constantine-Cyril and Methodius<sup>99</sup> from the Lower Basilica<sup>100</sup> of St. Clement, an important mural in search of the St. Constantine-Cyril's period appearance is the lunette fresco called *Anastasis*<sup>101</sup> from the same site. On the left side of the fresco there is a picture of an eastern-looking monk<sup>102</sup> holding a

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>97</sup> ALCHERMES 1995, p. 5, fig. 2; GOODSON 2010, p. 183-184.

<sup>98</sup> FRANCIA 1975, p. 324; TACHIAOS 2002, p. 214; WEHRENS 2016, p. 123.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>99</sup> The first one was found in the narthex of the lower basilica and concerns the transfer of the body of St. Clement. A central picture of this mural consists of Pope Nicholas I (incorrectly painted instead of Hadrian II) along with Sts. Constantine-Cyril and Methodius standing beside him. WALTER 1993, VIIb/109, fig. 15a; YAWN 2012, p. 5-6. The second fresco, called the *Particular Judgment*, was discovered between two pillars of the colonnade which separated the narthex of the lower basilica from the atrium. In addition to Sts. Constantine-Cyril and Methodius, also St. Andrew, St. Clement, Sts. Michael and Gabriel the Archangels were depicted there. OSBORNE 1981b, p. 335-341, fig. 3.

 $<sup>^{100}</sup>$  The Lower Basilica of St. Clement was presumably erected in the late  $4^{th}$  century or at the beginning of the 5th century. Later, in 1084, the basilica was damaged by Normans and then it was in use until ca. 1100. BARCLEY LLOYD 1986, p. 199; HNILICA 1990, p. 135; OSBORNE 1981b, p. 341.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>101</sup> The lunette fresco is situated on the nave side of a short wall that detached the nave from the right aisle at the apsidal end of the lower basilica. OSBORNE 1981a, p. 255-287.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>102</sup> OSBORNE 1981a, p. 269; OSBORNE 1984, p. 181-182.

decorated book, probably the evangeliary, in his left hand  $^{103}$ . Like an eastern-style monk, he is dressed in blue apparel with white dots and his head is covered by white hood with red geometric patterns, including crosses and his face is bearded and his right hand is open outwards. This monk is also portrayed in front of a square halo  $^{104}$ , which likely contained an inscription in white letters. This square halo might be dated to the second half of the  $9^{th}$  century and early years of the  $10^{th}$  century  $^{105}$ . The second inscription was between Christ's mandorla and a column on the left and just its part remains there. It seems that there was the abbreviation of the name Christ in the Greek alphabet, represented by two white letters – "XC" – the chi and lunate sigma  $^{106}$ .

In the Byzantine art the Anastasis scene usually did not appear before the 9th century, as it can be demonstrated in the case of the Chludov Psalter's illuminations<sup>107</sup>. In the eastern or Byzantine Church milieu the decorated hoods were not worn only by patriarchs, but also by monks. Alexandrian Patriarch St. Cyril (412 - 444) and Constantinopolitan Patriarch St. Methodius I are depicted with hoods decorated by a red cross and dots on mosaics from the second half of the 9th century in the north tympanum of St. Sophia's Basilica in Constantinople 108. There are frescoes, which can be dated between the 7th and 10th centuries 109, from the oratory of St. Saba's monastery (of eastern and Greek character) upon the Aventine Hill in Rome depicting (inter alia) bearded monks who wear hoods with white dots arranged in the form of a cross, though they are similar to hoods of the Benedictines<sup>110</sup>. St. Dometius on the fresco from the Chapel of the Holy Physicians in the Ancient Church of St. Mary (S. Maria Antiqua connected with Byzantine presence in Rome) has got a hood with decorations too. They consist of two pairs of white stripes and dots inside them which form crosses111. This fresco could be dated to the pontificate of Pope John VII (705 – 707)<sup>112</sup>. The funerary monuments were not usual in early medieval Rome, but this custom was common in the Byzantine milieu. It is also evident from the story of Sts. Theodore and Joseph Studite. Following the Translatio S. Theodori Studitae et Iosephi from the 9th century, their mortal remains were brought to their tombs in Constantinople in 844 and above them their portraits were placed<sup>113</sup>.

According to the art historical analysis made by John Osborne, the monk on the fresco was presumably painted in the second half of the 9th century<sup>114</sup> and

 $<sup>^{103}</sup>$  The Jesus Christ is beating a devil and helping Adam from Limbo on the right side of the mural. BOYLE 1988, p. 78.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>104</sup> BOYLE 1988, p. 78; MARCHIORI 2007, p. 146, fig. 110; OSBORNE 1981a, p. 257-258, plate I-IV.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>105</sup> OSBORNE 1981a, p. 271.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>106</sup> OSBORNE 1984, p. 172.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>107</sup> OSBORNE 1981a, p. 259.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>108</sup> OSBORNE 1981a, p. 266-268.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>109</sup> WEHRENS 2016, p. 327.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>110</sup> OSBORNE 1981a, p. 268-269.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>111</sup> OSBORNE 1981a, p. 269.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>112</sup> WEHRENS 2016, p. 296.

<sup>113</sup> Cited from OSBORNE 1981a, p. 273.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>114</sup> OSBORNE 1984, p. 192.

represents his own funerary monument<sup>115</sup>. He could be St. Constantine-Cyril who had become a monk named Cyril (in Rome), 50 days before his own death<sup>116</sup>, and who died at the age of 42 on the 14<sup>th</sup> of February 869<sup>117</sup>.

An important literary account that informs us about the St. Constantine-Cyril's tomb on the right hand side of the altar<sup>118</sup> in the (Lower) Basilica of St. Clement is written in the so called *Roman legend*. In the end, a connecting link between the monk from the *Anastasis* and the account from the *Roman legend* might be an account from the Life of Constantine the Philosopher. An anonymous author of this biography (likely St. Methodius) noted the following: "So they put him (Cyril) with a coffin to a grave on the right side of the altar in the Church of St. Clement. And immediately many miracles have started to happen there. And Romans, who had seen that, started to respect his holiness and venerability even more. They painted his portrait over the grave and started to shine light over it day and night and praise God,..."<sup>119</sup>.

## The Cyrillo-Methodian mission and Greeks within the relations between the Papacy and Byzantium

There were mainly two theological issues that the East and the West did not agree on during the 9th century. The first one was the origin of the Holy Spirit and the second one was iconoclasm<sup>120</sup>. The latter issue was already over in the second half of the 9th century, although only recently. Pope Nicholas I and Hadrian II perceived themselves in a position<sup>121</sup> to call a synod to depose the Patriarch of Constantinople. The Papacy and its realm, which lacked manpower regarding military threats in the 9th century too, were affected by the raid of the Arabs on Rome in 846 and their persisting threat in the (western) Mediterranean. It has seriously depressed the Roman economy and the commencement of the City of Amalfi as a new trade hub in the Mediterranean Sea could also stand behind the decline in commerce revenues for Rome<sup>122</sup>.

One might assume that the Greek envoys and missionaries, Sts. Constantine-Cyril and Methodius, coming from the Great Moravian territory, where they had started to christianise and teach people, would not have gained much success with the Pope. Great Moravian Prince Rastislav (846 – 870) wanted to obtain a church administration independent from the clerics of East Francia, namely of the Bishopric of Passau, and therefore until the year 863 he asked for (church) teachers and legislators from Byzantium of Emperor Michael III and Patriarch St.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>115</sup> OSBORNE 1981a, p. 280, 287.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>116</sup> Vita Constantini-Cyrilli cum translatione S. Clementis 10; 111; Žitije Konstantina Filosofa XVIII; p. 92.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>117</sup> TACHIAOS 1989, p. 118.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>118</sup>"...ad dexteram partem altaris ipsius (beati Clementis),..." Vita Constantini-Cyrilli cum translatione S. Clementis 12; p. 112-113.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>119</sup> Žitije Konstantina Filosofa XVIII; p. 94-95.

<sup>120</sup> DE VRIES 2018a.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>121</sup> It was in the context of the Roman Patriarch who has been "primus inter pares" among the other patriarchs and we can even claim that Pontiff Nicholas I took himself as a holder of "plenitudo potestatis" during his pontificate. DE VRIES 2018b.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>122</sup> GANTNER 2012, p. 405-407, 407, n. 20; GANTNER 2015, p. 260.

Photius<sup>123</sup>. Initially, he addressed Pope Nicholas I to gain his missionaries, but his request was left unanswered<sup>124</sup>. The same Pope even wrote a letter (in the middle of the year 864) which endorsed East Frankish King Louis the German in his plans to subjugate Rastislav<sup>125</sup>. Pope Nicholas I (also) counted on King Louis the German in disputes between rulers of the Frankish empire<sup>126</sup>.

Sts. Constantine-Cyril and Methodius, who finally came to Great Moravia from Byzantium, introduced the Old Church Slavonic language into liturgy there<sup>127</sup>. Thereby they gave Latin clerics more reasons to question their orthodoxy and usurp their territory. The Salonica brothers were probably in 867 on their journey home via Venice<sup>128</sup> when they got the invitation of Pope Nicholas I (858 – 867) to Rome concerning their introduction of the Slavonic liturgy in Moravia. Nicholas I was already dead in the time of their arrival in Rome and his successor, Pope Hadrian II, welcomed them and relics of St. Clement in a very respectful way<sup>129</sup> and in the end he approved the Slavonic liturgy<sup>130</sup>.

Pope Nicholas I did not recognise St. Photius as a Patriarch (858 – 867, 877 – 886) after his first accession to the office, because it was without the Pope's approval. In 863 the Pope called a synod to Lateran to depose him and restore Rome-inclined Patriarch St. Ignatius (847 – 858, 867 – 877)<sup>131</sup>. The Pope wanted to benefit again from the renewed papal jurisdiction over the Diocese of Illyricum, which was, alongside the Dioceses of Sicily and Calabria, taken from the Popes to the Patriarchate of Constantinople by the Byzantine Emperors some time in 730s-760s, i.e. during the time of iconoclasm in Byzantium<sup>132</sup>. The forced Christianisation of Bulgaria, which was situated in eastern Illyricum, started by St. Photius' priests after the defeat of Khan Boris by Byzantium in 864. However, baptised Khan/Prince Boris-Michael (852 - 889) wanted its own ecclesiastical organisation, what St. Photius did not want to fulfil, so Boris-Michael turned upon East Francia and the Pope<sup>133</sup>. In Nicholas' answers to the Bulgarians from the year 866 (Responsa Nicolai papae ad consulta Bulgarorum), Pontiff Nicholas I stated that there were three legitimate patriarchs, because their origin went back to the apostles and Constantinople did not have such a history, and thus together with Jerusalem lacked the necessary legitimacy<sup>134</sup>. Bishops and priests of Pope Nicholas I achieved success in the Christianisation of Bulgaria in this time and were present there until 870. Nicholas I promised in his answers to Bulgarians

<sup>123</sup> Žitije Mefodija, archijepiskopa Moravbska V; p. 123-125.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>124</sup> Žitije Mefodija, Archijepiskopa Moravbska VIII; p. 128.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>125</sup> Epistolae MMFH 23; p. 114-115.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>126</sup> BARTOŇKOVÁ & VEČERKA 2011, p. 112.

 $<sup>^{127}\,\</sup>mathrm{HNILICA}$ 1990, p. 49, 53; GALUŠKA & VAŠKOVÝCH 2013, p. 22; VRAGAŠ 2013, p. 47-48.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>128</sup> DVORNIK 1970, p. 131-133.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>129</sup> Vita Constantini-Cyrilli cum translatione S. Clementis 9; p. 110.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>130</sup> Additional literature in relation to this approval you can find mentioned here: HUSÁR 2017, p. 95-96.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>131</sup> Epistolae MMFH 29-32; p. 117-118; Vita Nicolai I, Liber Pontificalis 107, 42; p. 223-224.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>132</sup> BETTI 2014, p. 118, n. 34.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>133</sup> VAVŘÍNEK 2013, p. 142-145.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>134</sup> Epistolae MGH VI, IV, V, 99, XCII; p. 596-597.

and their Khan/Prince Boris-Michael that they would have got their own archbishop for Bulgaria from Rome if they had had enough Christians and established Christianity in their country. But that never happened <sup>135</sup>. Then in 867 Pope Nicholas I was condemned at the synod summoned by Patriarch St. Photius in Constantinople <sup>136</sup>.

The Pope Hadrian II himself allegedly demonstrated his modesty and humbleness to the servants of God, who were Greeks and of other origins, in his own way on Friday after the third Sunday before Lent (the 20<sup>th</sup> of February) in 868<sup>137</sup>. "In humility he personally poured water over the hands of them all, he set the meal, he served the cups, and, to make them more disposed to take part in the luncheon, he did what he knew no pontiff before himself had done: he reclined with them, joining in with them in praising God with hymns and spiritual chants, (going through) the whole vast company of them there as they kept up a constant chorus (of praise)"138. We cannot exclude the possibility that Sts. Constantine-Cyril and Methodius could attend this banquet<sup>139</sup>.

According to the Life of Constantine the Philosopher<sup>140</sup> (in 869) the Greeks from Rome along with the Romans<sup>141</sup> were instructed by Hadrian II to gather with candles, chant over dead Constantine-Cyril, and arrange for him the same funeral procession as for the Pope himself. In the same year Pope Hadrian II repeated the synod (in St. Peter's Basilica) that condemned deposed St. Photius, the initial supporter of the Salonica brothers<sup>142</sup>. That continued at the Constantinopolitan council of 869 – 870, where the actions made by Pope Nicholas I and Hadrian II against St. Photius were proved<sup>143</sup>. However, on the basis of this council the ecclesiastical jurisdiction over the Bulgarian territory returned to the Constantinopolitan patriarchate and Latin clergy was expelled from this area<sup>144</sup>.

Even though Pope John VIII, Hadrian II's successor, finally confirmed the orthodoxy of Greek Methodius and the Slavonic liturgy by his letter called the *Industriae tuae* in 880<sup>145</sup>, the previous policy of this Pope quite did not regard Greeks with favour. Pope John VIII intensively tried to spread the papal jurisdiction over the Bulgarian, Croatian and Dalmatian Church during the 870s, against claims of the Constantinopolitan patriarchate <sup>146</sup>. Emperor Basil I (867 – 886), by contrast, sent his own missionaries to Serbs and Croatians which was

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>135</sup> VAVŘÍNEK 2013, p. 146.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>136</sup> GALLAGHER 2008, p. 594; VAVŘÍNEK 2013, p. 147.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>137</sup> One can guess that this event most likely referred to the followers and supporters of Patriarch St. Ignatius too. DAVIS 1995, p. 266, n. 40 and p. 267.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>138</sup> Vita Hadriani II, Liber Pontificalis 108: 16; p. 267.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>139</sup> DAVIS 1995, p. 267, n.42; DVORNIK 1970, p. 138; OBOLENSKY 1988, p. 10; TACHIAOS 1989, p. 115, 118.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>140</sup> Žitije Konstantina Filosofa XVIII; p. 94.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>141</sup> The *Roman Legend* mentions just the Greek and Roman clerics. *Vita Constantini-Cyrilli cum translatione S. Clementis* 10; p. 111.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>142</sup> Vita Hadriani II, Liber Pontificalis 108, 32-33; p. 274-275.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>143</sup> DAVIS 1995, p. 253; GALLAGHER 2008, p. 594.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>144</sup> TODOROV 2010, p. 184.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>145</sup> In June 880. *Industriae tuae*; p. 161-173.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>146</sup> BETTI 2014, p. 128-132; ŽIVKOVIĆ 2012, p. 212-214.

connected with his intention to found his administration in Dalmatia <sup>147</sup>. Pope John VIII demanded from Serbian Prince Mutimír for his return to the Pannonian diocese, which was administrated by a bishop appointed by Rome, i.e. St. Methodius <sup>148</sup>. As I have stated before, John the Deacon composed for the same Pope the *Life of Gregory the Great* in 873 – 876, where we can recognise hostility to the Greek monks in the St. Andrew's monastery in Clivus Scauri. In spite of that, Anastasius the Librarian favoured Constantine-Cyril <sup>149</sup> even during the first half of John VIII's pontificate as we can see it in documents of the Constantinopolitan council of 869 – 870<sup>150</sup> and his official correspondence with Emperor Charles the Bald (875 – 877) <sup>151</sup> and Bishop Gauderich of Velletri <sup>152</sup> in 875 – 876.

A positive approach that Pope John VIII had towards Greek St. Methodius, though he was still his archbishop, could also have been connected with John's acceptance of the decrees of St. Photian's Great Council of Reconciliation (between the papacy and the Constantinopolitan patriarchate) held from November 879 to March 880<sup>153</sup> in Constantinople that refused (inter alia) the "filioque clause" in the Nicene Creed<sup>154</sup>. The Pope also needed Byzantine ships from south Italy (mainly from 877 to 880) to protect Rome from possible sacking by the Arab navy from the south<sup>155</sup> and therefore it could change his previous bad attitude to Greeks. And there is no doubt that the main goal of Pope John VIII during his reign was to get rid Rome and Southern Italy of Arabs what is documented in his 314 letters from 867 – 882<sup>156</sup>. That he could achieve only with help from the Byzantine Empire, which was gaining strength and ground there at the time.

#### Conclusion

The Greek milieu and its ecclesiastical and secular institutions, or figures played an important role in the early medieval Rome. That can also be applied for

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>147</sup> LÖWE 1983, p. 663.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>148</sup> Epistolae MMFH 55; p. 138-139; LÖWE 1983, p. 662-663.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>149</sup> TACHIAOS 1989, p. 111, 114.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>150</sup> In the foreword of Anastasius's dossier (his translation to Latin) on the aforementioned council a Latin phrase appears concerning former Patriarch St. Photius and St. Constantine-Cyril: "Qui a Constantino philosopho magnae fanatitatis viro fortissimo ejus amico..." Thereby Anastasius honours St. Constantine-Cyril, although he associates him with St. Photius who was anathematised during the council. Sancta Synodus Octava Generalis, Constantinopolitana Quarta. Causae et Praefatio, 6; GALLAGHER 2008, p. 594.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>151</sup> In his own letter dated on the 23<sup>rd</sup> of March 875, Anastasius branded St. Constantine-Cyril as a great man (*vir magnus*), teacher of apostolic life (*apostolicae vitae praeceptor*), and a philosopher (*Constantinus philosophus*). *Epistolae MMFH* 59; p. 141-142.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>152</sup> A letter (written sometime between March 875 and 876) to Bishop Gauderich contains a section where Anastasius called Constantine from Thessaloniki, again a philosopher as well as the man of apostolic life (*Constantinus Thessalonicenus philosophus vir apostolicae vitae*) who has written a report on the discovery of Pope Clement's mortal remains. *Epistolae MMFH* 60; p. 143-144.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>153</sup> ŽIVKOVIĆ 2012, p. 214.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>154</sup> DVORNIK 1970, p. 190-191; MEYENDORFF 1991, p. 785-786.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>155</sup> GANTNER 2012, p. 410-411, 411, n. 39.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>156</sup> GANTNER 2012, p. 409.

the second half of the 9th century. Although Papal Rome split with the Byzantine Empire in the second half of the  $8^{th}$  century, this event did not befall the Greeks in Rome. The split happened because the Popes needed the real protection for own realm, what weakening Byzantium could not provide, and they did not agree with the Byzantine Emperors on iconoclasm. Firmly established positions of Greeks in the Eternal City could help the Salonica brothers and their mission, whether during liturgies or for protecting or accommodating them in the Greek quarter or in Greek institutions elsewhere in Rome. Anastasius the Librarian, as a representative figure of probable Greek origins and a member of the Papal secretariat, might help the mission of Sts. Constantine-Cyril and Methodius at the Papal court. Also two abbots of St. Erasmus' monastery on the Caelian Hill attained positions within the Roman Church and Papal court in the middle of the 9th century and in the second half of this century, namely the position of a bishop (Nicholas) and scriniarius (Zachary). Therefore even Greeks could achieve important positions in the examined period in Rome. Moreover St. Constantine-Cyril, who died as a monk in an unknown monastery of Rome, was opulently buried in the Basilica of St. Clement in 869. It should be noted that St. Blasius, who came to Rome with the Bulgarian embassy in 866, spent 18 years in the (Greek) Monastery of St. Caesarius on the Palatine Hill. Despite disputes with the Constantinopolitan patriarchate over the ecclesiastical jurisdiction in Illyricum and Dalmatia during the second half of the 9th century, the Papacy also looked for help of the Byzantine Empire, which grew stronger at the time again, to expel Arabs/Saracens from Southern Italy and thus to avert the danger that Rome would have been sacked by them. Whether it mattered to Greek St. Methodius' case or not, these events and the Great Council of Reconciliation in 879 - 880 could improve the common relations between the Pope and the Byzantine Emperor as well as Constantinopolitan Patriarch. Greeks were also important in the Eternal City at the end of the 9th century, because in 896 their schola welcomed, alongside the senate of Rome, victorious Eastern Frankish King Arnulf in Rome.

#### **BIBLIOGRAPHY**

Primary sources

Annales Fuldenses, in: Fridericus Kurze (ed.), Annales Fuldenses sive Annales Regni Francorum Orientalis, Impensis bibliopolii Hahniani, Hannovera, 1891.

*Βίος Κλήμεντος*, in: Dagmar Bartoňková & Radoslav Večerka (eds.), *Magnae Moraviae Fontes Historici II*, Koniasch Latin Press, Praha, 2010, p. 179-209.

*Epistolae MMFH*, in: Dagmar Bartoňková & Radoslav Večerka (eds.), *Magnae Moraviae Fontes Historici III*, Koniasch Latin Press, Praha, 2011, p. 107-217.

Epistolae MGH VI, in: Ernestus Perels (ed.), Monvmenta Germaniae Historica, Epistolarum, Tomus VI, Karolini Aevi IV, Apud Weidmannos, Berolinum, 1925.

Industriae tuae, in: Dagmar Bartoňková & Radoslav Večerka (eds.), Magnae Moraviae Fontes Historici III, Praha, Koniasch Latin Press, 2011, p. 161-173.

Leonis VI Tactica, in: George T. Dennis (ed.), The Taktika of Leo VI, Dumbarton Oaks, Washington, D. C., 2010.

Ciceronis de legibus – M. Tullii Ciceronis De Legibus, in: J. G. F. Powell (ed.), M. Tulli Ciceronis De Re Publica, De Legibus, Cato Maior de Senectute, Laelius de Amicitia, Oxford University Press, Oxford, 2006.

The Ohrid Leged – Кратко (проложно житие на св. Климента Охридски оть Димитрияа Хоматианъ, in: Йордан Иванов (ed.), Български старини из Македония, Българска академия на науките, Издателство Наука и изкуство, София, 1970, р. 316-321.

Sancta Synodus Octava Generalis, Constantinopolitana Quarta, in: Joannes Dominicus Mansi (ed.), Sanctorum conciliorum nova et amplissima collectio. Tomus Decimus Sextus, Venetia, 1771, 1-550.

Sancti Gregorii Magni Vita, auctore Joanne Diacono, in: J.-P. Migne, Patrologiae Cursus Completus. Tomus LXXV, Sanctus Gregorius Magnus, Paris, p. 41-242.

Translatio et Miracula Sanctorum Marcellini et Petri auctore Einhardo, in: G. Waitz et al., Monvmenta Germaniae Historica. Scriptorum. XV/I, Impensis Bibliopolii Hahniani, Hannovera, 1887, p. 238-264.

Vita Constantini-Cyrilli cum translatione s. Clementis, in: Dagmar Bartoňková & Radoslav Večerka (eds.), Magnae Moraviae Fontes Historici II, Koniasch Latin Press, Praha, 2010, p. 103-113.

Vita Doni, Liber Pontificalis 80, in: Raymond Davis (ed.), Liber Pontificalis. The Ancient biographies of the first ninety Roman bishops to AD 715, Liverpool University Press, Liverpool, 1989, p. 73.

Vita Gregorii II, Liber Pontificalis 91, in: Raymond Davis (ed.), The Lives of the Eighth-Century Popes (Liber Pontificalis). The Ancient Biographies of Nine Popes from AD 715 to AD 817, Liverpool University Press, Liverpool, 1992, p. 3-16.

Vita Gregorii IV, Liber Pontificalis 103, in: Raymond Davis (ed.), The Lives of the Ninth-Century Popes (Liber Pontificalis), Liverpool University Press, Liverpool, 1995, p. 49-70.

Vita Hadriani II, Liber Pontificalis 108, in: Raymond Davis (ed.), The Lives of the Ninth-Century Popes (Liber Pontificalis), Liverpool University Press, Liverpool, 1995, p. 259-294.

Vita Leonis III, Liber Pontificalis 98, in: Raymond Davis (ed.), The Lives of the Eighth-Century Popes (Liber Pontificalis). The Ancient Biographies of Nine Popes from AD 715 to AD 817, Liverpool University Press, Liverpool, 1992, p. 179-230.

Vita Leonis IV, Liber Pontificalis 105, in: Raymond Davis (ed.), The Lives of the Ninth-Century Popes (Liber Pontificalis), Liverpool University Press, Liverpool, 1995, p. 111-160.

Vita Nicolai I, Liber Pontificalis 107, in: Raymond Davis (ed.), The Lives of the Ninth-Century Popes (Liber Pontificalis), Liverpool University Press, Liverpool, 1995, p. 205-247.

Vita Pauli I, Liber Pontificalis 95, in: Raymond Davis (ed.), The Lives of the Eighth-Century Popes (Liber Pontificalis). The Ancient Biographies of Nine Popes from AD 715 to AD 817, Liverpool University Press, Liverpool, 1992, p. 80-84.

Vita Paschalis I, Liber Pontificalis 100, in: Raymond Davis (ed.), The Lives of the Ninth-Century Popes (Liber Pontificalis), Liverpool University Press, Liverpool, 1995, p. 5-30.

Žitije Konstantina Filosofa, in: Dagmar Bartoňková & Radoslav Večerka (eds.), Magnae Moraviae Fontes Historici II, Koniasch Latin Press, Praha, 2010, p. 43-95.

Žitije Mefodija, archijepiskopa Moravbska, in: Dagmar Bartoňková & Radoslav Večerka (eds.), Magnae Moraviae Fontes Historici II, Koniasch Latin Press, Praha, 2010, p. 116-140.

Žitije Nauma (II), in: Dagmar Bartoňková & Radoslav Večerka (eds.), Magnae Moraviae Fontes Historici II, Koniasch Latin Press, Praha, 2010, p. 226-228.

#### Authors

ALCHERMES 1995 – Joseph D. Alchermes, *Petrine Politics: Pope Symmachus and the Rotunda of St. Andrew at Old St. Peter's*, The Catholic Historical Review 81 (1995), 1, p. 1-40.

BARCLEY LLOYD 1986 – Joan E. Barcley Lloyd, *The Building History of the Medieval Church of S. Clemente in Rome*, Journal of the Society of Architectural Historians 45 (1986), 3, p. 197-223.

BARTOŇKOVÁ & VEČERKA 2011 – Dagmar Bartoňková & Radoslav Večerka (eds.), Magnae Moraviae Fontes Historici III, Praha, 2011.

BATIFFOL 1888 – Pierre Batiffol, *Librairies byzantines à Rome*, Mélanges d'archéologie et d'histoire 8 (1888), p. 297-308.

BETTI 2014 – Maddalena Betti, *The Making of Christian Moravia (858-882). Papal Power and Political Reality*, Leiden / Boston, 2014.

BOLLÓK 2016 – Adam Bollók, Rediscovering Antiquities and Reviving the Past. Byzantium during the 9<sup>th</sup> and 10<sup>th</sup> Centuries, Convivium 3 (2016), 1, p. 60-75.

BOYLE 1988 – Leonard Boyle, The site of the Tomb of St. Cyril in the Lower Basilica of San Clemente, Rome, in: Edward G. Ferrugia, Robert F. Taft & Gino K. Piovesana (eds.), Christianity Among the Slavs: the Heritage of Saints Cyril and Methodius. Acts of the International Congress Held on the Eleventh Centenary of the Death of St. Methodius. Rome, October 8-11, 1985, Pont. Institutum Studiorum Orientalium, Rome, 1988, p. 75-82.

COSTAMBEYS & LEYSER 2007 – Marios Costambeys & Conrad Leyser, *To be the Neighbour of St. Stephen: Patronage, Martyr Cult, and Roman Monasteries, c.* 600–c. 900, in: Kate Cooper & Julia Hillner (eds.), *Religion, Dynasty, and Patronage in Early Christian Rome,* 300-900, Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 2007, p. 262-287.

DAVIS 1992 - Raymond Davis (ed.), The Lives of the Eighth-Century Popes (Liber Pontificalis), Liverpool University Press, Liverpool, 1992.

DAVIS 1995 - Raymond Davis (ed.), The Lives of the Ninth-Century Popes (Liber Pontificalis), Liverpool University Press, Liverpool, 1995.

DEY 2008 – Hendrik W. Dey, Diaconiae, Xenodochia, Hospitalia and Monasteries: 'Social Security' and the Meaning of Monasticism in Early Medieval Rome, Early Medieval Europe 16 (2008), 4, p. 398-422.

DUCHESNE 1892 – L. Duchesne, Le Liber Pontificalis. Tome second, Ernest Thorin, Paris, 1892.

DVORNIK 1970 – František Dvornik, *Byzantine Missions Among the Slavs. SS. Constantine-Cyril and Methodius*, New Brunswick / New Jersey, 1970.

EKONOMOU 2007 – Andrew J. Ekonomou, Rome and the Greek Popes. Eastern Influences on Rome and the Papacy from Gregory the Great to Zacharias, A.D. 590-752, Lexington Books, Lanham – Plymouth, 2007.

FERRARI 1957 – Guy Ferrari, Early Roman Monasteries. Notes for the History of the Monasteries and Convents at Rome from the V through the X Century, Pontificio Istituto di Archeologia Cristiana, Città del Vaticano, Rome, 1957.

FRANCIA 1975 – Ennio Francia, San Paolo fuori le Mura, in: John P. O'Neill (ed.), The Vatican Spirit and Art of Christian Rome, Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York, 1975, p. 324-331.

GALLAGHER 2008 – Clarence Gallagher, *The two Churches*, in: Elizabeth Jeffreys, John Haldon & Robin Cormack (eds.), *The Oxford Handbook of Byzantine Studies*, Oxford University Press, Oxford, 2008, p. 592-598.

GAĽUŠKA & VAŠKOVÝCH 2013 – Luděk Galuška & Miroslav Vaškových, *Křesťanství na Velké Moravě a byzantská misie*, Slovácké museum v Uhreském Hradišti, Uherské Hradište, 2013.

GANTNER 2012 – Clemens Gantner, New Visions of Community in Ninth-Century Rome: The Impact of the Saracen Threat on the Papal World View, in: Walter Pohl, Clemens Gantner & Richard Payne (eds.), Visions of Community in the Post-Roman World. The West, Byzantium and the Islamic World, 300-1100, Ashgate, Farnham / Burlington, 2012, p. 403-421.

GANTNER 2013 - Clemens Gantner, The Label "Greeks" in the Papal Diplomatic Repertoire in the Eighth Century, in: Walter Pohl & Gerda Heydemann (eds.), Strategies of Identification: Ethnicity and Religion in Early Medieval Europe, Berepols, Turnhout, 2013, p. 303-349.

GANTNER 2014a – Clemens Gantner, Freunde Roms und Völker der Finsternis. Die päpstliche Konstruktion von Anderen im 8. und 9. Jahrhundert, Böhlau Verlag, Wien/Köln, 2014.

GANTNER 2014b - Clemens Gantner, Romana urbs: Levels of Roman and Imperial Identity in the City of Rome, Early Medieval Europe 22 (2014), 4, p. 461-475.

GANTNER 2015 – Clemens Gantner, *The Eighth-Century Papacy as Cultural Broker*, in: Clemens Gantner, Rosamond McKitterick & Sven Meeder (eds.), *The Resources of the Past in Early Medieval Europe*, Cambridge, 2015, p. 245-261.

GOODSON 2010 – Caroline Goodson, The Rome of Pope Paschal I. Papal Power, Urban Renovation, Church Rebuilding and Relic Translation, 817-824, Cambridge, 2010.

GREATREX 2000 – Geoffrey Greatrex, Roman Identity in the Sixth Century, in: Stephen Mitchell & Geoffrey Greatrex (eds.), Ethnicity and Culture in Late Antiquity, London / Swansea, 2000, p. 267-292.

ĤNILICA 1990 – Ján Hnilica, Svätí Cyril a Metod. Horliví hlásatelia božieho slova a verní pastieri cirkvi, Vydavateľstvo Alfa, Bratislava, 1990.

HUSÁR 2017 – Martin Husár, *Processions and Architecture of Papal Rome in Relation to the Stay of the Salonica Brothers in Rome*, Graeco-Latina Brunensia 22/1 (2017), p. 93-110.

IZZI 2010 – Luisa Izzi, Representing Rome. The influence of Rome on Aspects of the Public Arts of Early Anglo-Saxon England (c. 600-800). PhD thesis, University of York, York, 2010.

KRAUTHEIMER 1937 – Richard Krautheimer, *Corpus Basilicarum Christianarum Romae. Le basiliche crisiane antiche di Roma (Sec. IV–IX). Vol. I,* Pontifico Instituto di Archeologia Cristiana, Roma, 1937.

KRAUTHEIMER, FRANKL & CORBETT 1959 – Richard Krautheimer, Wolfgang Frankl & Spencer Corbett, *Corpus Basilicarum Christianarum Romae. The Early Christian Basilicas of Rome (IV – IX Cent.). Vol. II*, Pontifico Instituto di Archeologia Cristiana – Institute of Fine Arts, New York University, Roma / New York, 1959.

KRAUTHEIMER, CORBETT & FRANKL 1970 – Richard Krautheimer & Spencer Corbett & Wolfgang Frankl, *Corpus Basilicarum Christianarum Romae. The Early Christian Basilicas of Rome (IV – IX Cent.). Vol. IV*, Pontifico Instituto di Archeologia Cristiana – Institute of Fine Arts, New York University, Roma / New York, 1970.

KRAUTHEIMER 2000 – Richard Krautheimer, *Rome. Profile of a City*, 312–1308. With a new foreword by Marvin Trachtenberg, Princeton University Press, Princeton, 2000.

LÖWE 1983 - Heinz Löwe, Cyrill und Methodius zwischen Byzanz und Rom, in: Gli Slavi occidentali e meridionali nell'alto Medioevo: 15–21 aprile 1982. Tomo Secondo, Presso la sede del centro, Spoleto, 1983, p. 631-686.

MARCHIORI 2007 – Maria Laura Marchiori, *Art and Reform in Tenth-Century Rome – The Paintings of S. Maria in Pallaria*, PhD dissertation, Queen's University, Kingston, 2007.

MARINČÁK 2005 – Šimon Marinčák, *Slovanská liturgia – liturgické dedičstvo byzantskej misie z 9. storočia?*, Slavica Slovaca 40 (2005), 1, p. 34-62.

MASKARINEC 2013 – Maya Maskarinec, Who Were the Romans? Shifting Scripts of Romanness in Early Medieval Italy, in: Walter Pohl & Gerda Heydemann (eds.), Strategies of Identification: Ethnicity and Religion in Early Medieval Europe, Turnhout, 2013, p. 297-363.

MASKARINEC 2014 – Maya Maskarinec, Foreign saints at home in eighth- and ninth-century Rome: the patrocinia of diaconiae, xenodochia, and Greek monasteries, in: Stanislava Kuzmová Ana Marinkovic & Trpimir Vedriš (eds.), Cuius Patrocinio Tota Gaudet Regio. Saints' Cults and the Dynamics of Regional Cohesion, Zagreb, 2014, p. 21-38.

MASKARINEC 2018 – Maya Maskarinec, City of Saints: Rebuilding Rome in the Early Middle Ages, University of Pennsylvania Press, Philadelphia, 2018.

MEYENDORFF 1991 – John Meyendorff, *Filioque*, in: Alexander P. Kazhdan (ed.), *The Oxford Dictionary of Byzantium. Volume* 2, New York, 1991, p. 785-786.

MICHEL 1952 – Anton Michel, *Die griechischen Klostersiedlungen zu Rom bis zur Mitte des 11. Jahrhunderts*, Ostkirchliche Studien 1 (1952), p. 32-45.

NOBLE 1991 – Thomas F. X. Noble, *The Republic of St. Peter. The Birth of the Papal State, 680-825*, University of Pennsylvania Press, Philadelphia, 1991.

NOBLE 2009 - Thomas F. X. Noble, *Images, Iconoclasm, and the Carolingians*, University of Pennsylvania Press, Philadelphia, 2009.

OBOLENSKY 1988 – Dimitri Obolensky, Six Byzantine Portraits, Oxford University Press, Oxford, 1988.

ORLENDI 1731 – Franciscus Orlendi, *Orbis sacer et profanus illustrates. Pars Secunda. Europam complectens. Volumen Primum,* Bernardo Peperini, Florentia, 1731.

OSBORNE 1981a – John Osborne, The painting of the Anastasis in the lower church of San Clemente, Rome: a re-examination of the evidence for the location of the tomb of St. Cyril, Byzantion 51 (1981), p. 255-287.

OSBORNE 1981b – John Osborne, The 'Particular Judgement': an Early Medieval Wall-Painting in the Lower Church of San Clemente, Rome, The Burlington Magazine 123 (1981), 939, p. 335-341.

OSBORNE 1984 – John Osborne, Early Medieval Wall-Paintings in the Lower Church of San Clemente, Rome, Garland Publishing, New York / London, 1984.

POHL 2012 – Walter Pohl, Ethnicity, Religion and Empire, in: Walter Pohl, Clemens Gantner & Richard Payne (eds.), Visions of Community in the Post-Roman World. The West, Byzantium and the Islamic World, 300-1100, Ashgate, Farnham/Burlington, 2012, p. 1-23.

RAPP 2008 – Claudia Rapp, Hellenic Identity, Romanitas, and Christianity in Byzantium, in: Katerina Zacharia (ed.), Hellenisms. Culture, Identity, and Ethnicity from Antiquity to Modernity, Ashgate, Burlington, VT, 2008, p. 127-147.

SANSTERRE 1983a – Jean-Marie Sansterre, Les moines grecs et orientaux à Rome aux époques byzantine et carolingienne (milieu du VIe s. - fin du IXe s.). I. Texte, Bruxelles, 1983.

SANSTERRE 1983b – Jean-Marie Sansterre, Les moines grecs et orientaux à Rome aux époques byzantine et carolingienne (milieu du VIe s. - fin du IXe s.). II. Bibliographie, notes. Index et cartes, Bruxelles, 1983.

SANSTERRE 1988 - Jean-Marie Sansterre, *Le monachisme byzantin à Rome*, Settimane di Studio del Centro Italiano di Studi Sull' Alto Medioevo 34 (1988), 1-2, p. 701-750.

STOURAITIS 2014 – Ioannis Stouraitis, *Roman identity in Byzantium: a critical approach*, Byzantinische Zeitschrift 107 (2014), 1, p. 175-220.

STOURAITIS 2017 – Yannis Stouraitis, Reinventing Roman Ethnicity in High and Late Medieval Byzantium, Medieval worlds 5 (2017), p. 70-94.

ŠKOVIERA 2007 – Andrej Škoviera, Liturgia cyrilometodskej misie na Veľkej Morave, in: Jozef Michalov et al. (eds.), Duchovné, intelektuálne a politické pozadie cyrilometodskej misie pred jej príchodom na Veľkú Moravu, Univerzita Konštantína Filozofa v Nitre, Nitra, 2007, p. 104-130.

ŠKOVIERA 2010 – Andrej Škoviera, *Svätí slovanskí sedmopočetníci*, Slovenský komitét slavistov, Slavistický ústav Jána Stanislava SAV, Bratislava, 2010.

TACHIAOS 1989 – Anthony-Emil N. Tachiaos, Cyril and Methodius of Thessalonica. The Acculturation of the Slavs, Thessaloniki, 1989.

TACHIAOS 2002 – Anthony-Emil N. Tachiaos, Cyril And Methodius' Visit to Rome in 868: Was it Scheduled or Fortuitous?, in: Peter Schreiner & Olga Strakhov (eds.). Chrysai Pylai. Zlataja Vrata. Essays presented to Ihor Ševčenko on his eightieth birthday by his colleagues and students (Palaeoslavica 10/2), Cambridge, MA, 2002, p. 210–221.

VAVŘÍNEK 2013 – Vladimír Vavřínek, Cyril a Metoděj mezi Konstaninopolí a Římem, Nakladatelství Vyšehrad, Praha, 2013.

VRAGAŠ 2013 – Štefan Vragaš, Cyrilo-metodské dedičstvo v náboženskom, národnom a kultúrnom živote Slovákov, Bratislava, 2013.

DE VRIES 2018a – Wilhelm de Vries, *Teologické rozdiely medzi Východom a Západom*, Konzervatívny denník Postoj (2018), https://svetkrestanstva.postoj.sk/ 30371/teologickerozdiely-medzi-vychodom-a-zapadom.

DE VRIES 2018b – Wilhelm de Vries, *Hlbšie dôvody Fotiovej schizmy*, Konzervatívny denník Postoj (2018), https://svetkrestanstva.postoj.sk/31346/ hlbsie-dovody-fotiovej-schizmy.

WALTER 1993 – Christopher Walter, Papal Political Imagery in the Medieval Lateran Palace (VIIb), in: Christopher Walter (ed.), Prayer and Power in Byzantine and Papal Imagery, Aldershot, 1993, VIIb/109–VIIb/136.

WEHRENS 2016 – Hans Georg Wehrens, Rom. Die christlichen Sakralbauten vom 4. bis zum 9. Jahrhundert. Ein Wademecum, Freiburg / Basel / Wien, 2016.

YAWN 2012 – Lila Yawn, Clement's New Clothes. The Destruction of Old S. Clemente in Rome, the Eleventh-Century Frescoes, and the Cult of (Anti)Pope Clement III, Reti Medievali Rivista 13 (2012), 1, p. 1-34.

ŽIVKOVIĆ 2012 – Tibor Živković, De conversione Croatorum et Serborum. A Lost Source, Čigoja štampa, Belgrade, 2012.