

de la Sainte Montagne ont été dépossédés des terres qui représentaient les offrandes des princes et des boyards roumains. La plupart de ces documents, dont l'existence avait déjà été signalée par Nikolopoulos et Oikonomidès, concernent les moines de Hotărani et leur domaine qui, à l'origine, avait appartenu à un *vornic* Petru d'Izbiceni, à ses fils Dragomir et Stanciul et au fils de l'aîné de ces frères, Constantin. Stanciul, devenu moine sous le nom de Stefan, et son neveu Constantin ont été emprisonnés à Yedi Kulé, ainsi que leur cousin Barbu Fălcoianu, en 1714, à cause de la déposition du prince Brancovan. Étant malades en prison «et n'ayant nul espoir d'être délivrés», ils ont fait leur testament et ont légué cette terre à la sketè de Hotărani, metochion de Dionysiou. C'est un des rares cas qui, à l'occasion du transfert d'une propriété quelconque, éclaire un drame humain, ayant aussi une signification politique.

L'excellente introduction qui accompagne les résumés des documents ajoute des éclaircissements sur les manuscrits byzantins donnés à Dionysiou par Mircea le Berger, prince de Valachie, et par son beau-père Pierre Rareș, prince de Moldavie. Ces évangélistes, datant du XI<sup>e</sup> et du XII<sup>e</sup> siècles, ont été présumablement offerts en même temps, en 1544. Le trésor du couvent contient aussi le reliquaire de saint Niphon que Neagoe Basarab avait fait orner ainsi que les reliquaires renfermant la tête du Prodrome et une main de saint Jean Chrysostome. Entre autres objets d'art de grand prix conservés à Dionysiou il y a plusieurs broderies provenant de Moldavie: l'épithaphion de Pierre Rareș, cinq épitrachilia et trois horaires du XVII<sup>e</sup> siècle, presque tous envoyés par des boyards apparentés entre eux. On attire également l'attention sur les deux manuscrits qui consacrent l'activité de Neagoe: la Vie de saint Niphon, écrite par Gabriel le prote de l'Athos, et les Conseils du prince pour son fils Théodose. Au sujet de ces textes il y a toute une littérature et on enregistre ici les principales opinions.

Les illustrations d'une qualité exceptionnelle (peintures de Dionysiou représentant Pierre Rareș et sa famille, la tombe de saint Niphon, quelques inscriptions, même des photos des églises de Hotărani et de Hlincea à l'état actuel) enrichissent le volume pour la joie des lecteurs qui n'ont pas visité la Sainte Montagne.

*Andrei Pippidi*

*Hommes de l'entre-deux. Parcours individuels et portraits de groupes sur la frontière de la Méditerranée (XVI<sup>e</sup>–XX<sup>e</sup> siècle)*, edited by Bernard HEYBERGER and Chantal VERDEIL, Paris, Les Indes savantes – Rivages des Xantons, 2009, 350 p.

Part of a steady-going series of text collections that Bernard Heyberger has directed in the past two decades<sup>12</sup> (in this particular case, together with Chantal Verdeil), this volume contains fourteen contributions to two round tables organized in 2003, in Tours, in conjunction with Mercedes Volait. The common grounds of the contributors' investigations are defined in the *Introduction* signed by the co-editors: during the period under survey, the Mediterranean was a free passage region, witnessing the travels, displacement and exile of countless communities and individuals over the borders separating the Christian states and the predominantly Muslim lands of the Ottoman Empire. While connections, relationships or exchanges between peoples and ethnic groups around the Mediterranean in Ottoman times have been discussed in countless other volumes, the authors of these essays have the merit of focusing on a multitude of communities, families and individuals who acted as mediators or intermediaries, living and working "in-between"<sup>13</sup> Europe and the Levant, Christianity and Islam, mediaeval times and modernity.

At a time when the idea of the "nation-state" had not yet triumphed, national identities were characterized by a certain indeterminacy, as revealed in the portraits of Maltese merchants, Corsicans living in Marseille, or non-Muslim authors and dragomans at work in the Ottoman provinces. Their

<sup>12</sup> B. Heyberger (ed.), *Chrétiens du monde arabe. Un archipel en terre d'Islam*, Paris, Autrement, 2003; B. Heyberger and Rémy Madinier (eds.), *L'Islam des marges. Mission chrétienne et espaces périphériques du monde musulman, XVI<sup>e</sup>–XX<sup>e</sup> siècles*, Paris, IISMM – Karthala, 2011, etc.

<sup>13</sup> „Entre deux chaises”, in a very appropriate French expression.

ties to more than one ethnic group and their familiarity with more than one particular religious observance are considered here as the fateful background for a life of journeying, connecting, and mediating between the diverse mentalities around the Mediterranean, and beyond. Their portraits are divided into two parts, moving from the destiny of communities and groups, covered in the first section – *Des groupes de médiateurs* – to that of particular families and individuals, surveyed in the second section – *Trajectoires individuelles et familiales*. Although topical overviews are not customary anymore in book reviews, the authors' vast array of interests requires brief comments on each contribution.

The world of trade provides the best examples of able negotiators and skilful merchants, knowledgeable in the languages, metrical systems, payment methods, and mentalities of their commercial partners: Anne Brogini's paper *Entre deux mondes: les Marchands de Malte au XVII<sup>e</sup> siècle* focuses on the various ethnic groups trading in Malta, from locals to Greeks, French, and Sicilians. Placed at the beginning of the volume, this paper already draws the reader's attention to the prominent role played by Mediterranean communities, especially the trading professions, on the fringes of the ethnic conglomerate that was the Ottoman Empire.<sup>14</sup> An interesting point made here concerns the unexpected support that Maltese merchants received from the ruling Knights of St John who, although opposed to a peaceful relationship with the Muslims, accepted that a thriving commerce with the South and East Mediterranean coasts helped the preservation of the Maltese identity.<sup>15</sup>

Michel Vergé-Franceschi, an expert in Corsican history<sup>16</sup>, focuses on the journeys and foreign connections of the Corsicans, more particularly those of several families established in Marseille to whom ambassadors, rich merchants, war lords, or even deys and beys belonged: Lenche, Porrata, Gaspari, Cipriani, and Roux (alias Rossi). The tale of the Corsicans' trade ambitions, pushing them from the thriving Coral Company and their Tunisian affairs to the initiative of seeking fortune in Martinique (1711), reads like an adventure story.

Bernard Heyberger, an assiduous researcher in the Roman archives<sup>17</sup>, whose previous works establish him as an authority on the Oriental Christians and their connections to the Latin Church<sup>18</sup>, surveys the life and works of several individuals who, leaving Aleppo or Damascus for Rome, are portrayed as worthy messengers of their native communities and an essential connection between the Turkish Muslims and the Western Europeans. Foreigners in distant lands after being marginalized at home by an oppressive Ottoman system, the travelling Eastern Christians considered here – Maronites, Melkites, and Armenians – often provided their European hosts with new elements to fuel the wide-spread  *clichés* of the day, picturing the "Turks" as oppressive, antagonistic to Christianity, and enemies of the Westerners.

Drawing on his extensive research on editing and printing in the Ottoman Empire and the contribution of non-Muslims to Ottoman Turkish literature, Johann Strauss surveys the status of historical and literary authors who were assigned a minor role in the annals of Ottoman literature, because of their attachment to some other creed or ethnicity. This author attempts a survey of the

<sup>14</sup> Unsurprisingly, the latest venue of the *Symposium Syriacum* (11<sup>th</sup> ed.) and the *International Christian Arabic Conference* (9<sup>th</sup> ed.), on 16–18 July and 19–21 July 2012 respectively, was indeed Malta, where a number of topics discussed in this volume were also covered, see [http://www.um.edu.mt/\\_data/assets/pdf\\_file/0008/156635/ixccas.pdf](http://www.um.edu.mt/_data/assets/pdf_file/0008/156635/ixccas.pdf).

<sup>15</sup> Elements in support of this point are also provided by Thomas Freller and Dolores Campoy in *Padre Ottomano and Malta. A story of the 1001 Nights. A sultan's son in Malta?*, Malta: Midsea Books, 2006.

<sup>16</sup> His book *Paoli, un Corse des Lumières*, Paris: Fayard, 2005, was granted the Prize of the French Academy in 2006.

<sup>17</sup> Archives of the "Sacra Congregazione De Propaganda Fide", the Urbano College, the Jesuit Company (ARSI), etc.

<sup>18</sup> See Bernard Heyberger, *Les chrétiens du Proche-Orient au temps de la Réforme catholique (Syrie, Liban, Palestine, XV<sup>e</sup>–XVIII<sup>e</sup> siècle)*, Rome, École Française de Rome, 1994, a major source for all interested in the Near Eastern Christians and their connections with Europe.

whole territory of the Empire, assessing the contribution of some Armenian, Greek, Macedonian and Bulgarian writers to the literature and printing of their lands under Ottoman rule. He briefly mentions the activity of non-Muslim intellectuals, diplomats and scholars in the Ottoman capital, such as the learned Mordtmann family and the eminent Russian Byzantinist Fyodor Uspensky, who headed the Russian Archaeological Institute in Constantinople between 1894 and 1914. Leaving aside the historical section of this article – an overview of Oriental studies in the Ottoman lands – the second part brings new insight into the life and works of “lost” Armenian writers and publishers (Garabed Panossian, Hagop Baronian, Diran Kelekian), Greek-Orthodox scholars of Armenian and Turkish (Dimitrios Tzolakides, Theodore Cassap, Evangelinos Misailidis), and the Phanariot dragomans of the Porte who wrote in Turkish (Jakovos Argyropoulo, ‘Yakovaki Efendi’). Given the general topic of the book, the *Karamanli* writers, briefly mentioned on pp. 155 and 165 (“écrivains grecs-orthodoxes turcophones d’Anatolie”), might have deserved a more extensive treatment.

I also feel bound to note that no mention is made of the Rumanians (here and anywhere in the volume), although their status at the fringes of the Empire allowed them to act as privileged mediators with the Ottoman officials. After fierce battles and elaborate negotiations (14<sup>th</sup>–15<sup>th</sup> c.), the ‘*ahdnāmes* and *sulhnāmes* that Moldavian and Wallachian princes signed with the Ottoman Porte permitted them to preserve their autonomy, faith and customs, and to be ruled by a local prince, “une exception anormale et ambigüe”.<sup>19</sup> As a consequence of their particular status, Romanian princes were asked by patriarchs and clergy of Constantinople, Jerusalem, Damascus, etc., to intercede with the Sultan in their favor and to support the Eastern Patriarchates politically and financially<sup>20</sup>. On the threshold of the 17<sup>th</sup>–18<sup>th</sup> centuries, Wallachians contributed to the printing of the first Christian books in Arabic types in territories under Ottoman rule (by Athanasios Dabbās, in Aleppo, in 1706, after two titles in Bucharest and Snagov, in 1701 and 1702).<sup>21</sup> Considering the common topic of the collected essays, this significant episode in the history of Arabic printing, a perfect example of successful Christian Arab initiative during the Ottoman rule, might at least have been mentioned, however briefly, when discussing printing in the Ottoman Empire<sup>22</sup> (p. 155–156). Strauss mentions the Phanariot dragoman Constantin Ypsilanti (born 1760), “qui a traduit des oeuvres de Vauban pour Selim III”, but fails to add that his services at the Ottoman court brought him the rule of Moldavia in 1799 and that, after conspiring in Bucharest for the liberation of Greece and serving as a governor of the Petchersk Fortress (after 1807), he died in Kiev (1816) – the perfect illustration of a life “in-between”.

Dragomans in the service of Western embassies and consulates in the major Ottoman cities constitute the topic covered by Maurits H. van den Boogert (the only essay in the volume presented in English). While the functions, legal status, and communal solidarity of this professional group are discussed, special attention is given to the situation of the Christian dragomans in Aleppo, holders of

<sup>19</sup> D. B. MacDonald, *Dār al-harb*, in A. J. Wensinck and J. H. Kramers (eds.), *Handwörterbuch des Islam*, Leiden, E. J. Brill, 1941, p. 89.

<sup>20</sup> See Petre Ș. Năsturel *Le Mont Athos et les Roumains. Recherches sur leurs relations du milieu du XIV<sup>e</sup> siècle à 1654*, Rome, 1986; Ralph H. Brewster, *Athos: the Holy Mountain*, in „The Geographical Magazine”, London, II, 4, Febr. 1936, p. 259–286 (with 32 photos and two maps); Marcu Beza, *Heritage of Byzantium*, London, 1947, p. 39–42; P. Lemerle, P. Wittek, *Recherches sur l'histoire et le statut des monastères athonites sous la domination turque*, *Archives du droit oriental*, III, Paris, 1948; *The Romanian Principalities and the Holy Places along the Centuries*, E. Băbuș, I. Moldoveanu, A. Marinescu (eds.), București, 2007.

<sup>21</sup> See Wahid Gdoura, *Le Début de l’Imprimerie Arabe à Istanbul et en Syrie: Évolution de l’Environnement Culturel (1706–1787)*, Tunis, Institut Supérieur de Documentation, 1985, *passim*; Eva Hanbutt-Benz, Dagmar Glass, Geoffrey Roper (eds.), *Middle Eastern Languages and the Print Revolution. A Cross-Cultural Encounter*, Westhofen, WVA – Verlag Skulima, 2002, p. 178–179; Ioana Feodorov, *The Romanian Contribution to Arabic Printing*, in *Impact de l’imprimerie et rayonnement intellectuel des Pays Roumains*, Bucharest: Biblioteca Bucureștilor, 2009, p. 41–61.

<sup>22</sup> Ibrahim Müteferrika (1674–1742), a Hungarian from Cluj (in North-Western Romania), was taken prisoner by the Turks and, after embracing the Muslim faith, printed in Istanbul, after 1728, in Arabic types, books on lexicography, geography and history.

a *berat* (in particular the Suryani faction). The extent to which they enjoyed the same privileges as “foreigners”, as indicated in the French capitulations of 1604 and 1673, is carefully analyzed. This article adds useful data for the study of the precise meanings of the term “Frank”, in terms of ethnicity, faith, and language.<sup>23</sup>

The arrival of modernity in the Ottoman Empire and the emergence of a community of well-trained doctors towards the end of Ottoman rule are discussed by Chantal Verdeil (*L'Empire, les communautés, la France: les réseaux des médecins ottomans à la fin du XIX<sup>e</sup> siècle*), while Mercedes Volait discusses the fate of art and architectural monuments in Cairo between Western Orientalist views and Egyptian attempts at conservation (*Retentissement et relais locaux de la “médiévalisation” du Caire, 1867–1933*). In the latter essay, several case-studies are presented, with extensive comments on the influence of Europeanizing tendencies and a foreign artistic training on the esthetic options of several key figures of Egyptian artistic society. Well documented and rich in information, this text provides food for thought to all readers interested in the conservation of the medieval artistic heritage of their particular country.

In the second section of the book, family portraits of several outstanding figures of Eastern members of the intellectual élite are presented, in the perspective of their role as mediators between the society of their native land and the “other” one, be it that of Ottoman or Egyptian rulers (in the cases of Konstantinos Kozyris of Crete and the Poche family of merchants in Aleppo, evoked by Elefteria Zei and Mafalda Adé-Winter, respectively) or that of their land of exile (Vincent Jamati, a Syrian immigrant in France, 1856–1947, addressed by Charlotte Hennebicque).

This volume aims to encompass all social strata: Isik Tamdoyan focuses on the story of Osman Hodja (Osman Efendi), accountant for a military unit at Kozan, near Adana, at the end of the 19<sup>th</sup> – beginning of 20<sup>th</sup> c., while Anne-Laure Dupont presents a condensed biography of Jirji Zeydan<sup>24</sup>, the celebrated reformer and promoter of the Arab Renaissance at the end of the 19<sup>th</sup> century (*al-Nahda*). Zeydan is presented as a success-story illustrating the progress of Arab society through education and work, based on the philosophy of *self-help*, as defined by the French contemporary sociologist Edmond Demolins. He is considered a “professional” mediator, who eagerly publicized and supported new, foreign ideas and customs all his life, in several countries around the Mediterranean.

A similar case of “professional” mediation, belonging to an earlier period (end of 18<sup>th</sup>-beginning of 19<sup>th</sup> c.), is presented by Marie-Carmen Smyrnelis in the first section of this volume: fifteen Smyrna Ottoman court officials (Greek, Jewish, and Armenian) involved in commercial ventures for the benefit of French trade companies, whose status also lies in-between the condition of non-Muslim subjects of the Ottoman Empire and that of *protégés* of their employer, the French colony.

Although marginal in the overall series of texts, Salim Dermarker’s account of the ill-fated Nigoghos Der Markarian, a dragoman at the English consulate in Aleppo, in 1884–1887, victim of both the hostile governor Jemil Pasha and the troubled political situation during the Russian-Turkish war, confirms the unsafe position of non-Muslim officials in the Ottoman Empire.

One cannot help but notice that whenever religion comes into the picture the authors, more often than not, restrict their focus to the Maronites, the Melkites, and the Armenians, leaving out the Greek-Orthodox of the Levant (excepted brief remarks by B. Heyberger, J. Strauss<sup>25</sup>, and M. H. van

<sup>23</sup> See Pedro Badénas, *La lingua franca, moyen d'échange et de rencontre dans un milieu commun*, in *Byzantinoslavica* LVI (1995), p. 493–505; Jocelyne Dakhlia, *Lingua franca: histoire d'une langue métisse en Méditerranée*, Aix-en-Provence, 2008, and Cyril Aslanov, “Débat sur l'ouvrage de Jocelyne Dakhlia, *Lingua franca. Histoire d'une langue métisse en Méditerranée*”, in *Langage et société*, 134, 2010, p. 103–113.

<sup>24</sup> See her outstanding work *Ġurġi Zaydān (1861–1914), écrivain réformiste et témoin de la Renaissance arabe*, Damas, Institut français du Proche-Orient, 760 p., and her article “Usages et acculturation de la Franc-maçonnerie dans les milieux intellectuels arabes à la fin du XIX<sup>e</sup> siècle à travers l'exemple de Jurġi Zaydān (1861–1914)”, in *La Franc-maçonnerie en Méditerranée (XVIII<sup>e</sup>–XX<sup>e</sup> s.) Modèles, circulations, transferts, Cahiers de la Méditerranée*, 72, 2006, p. 331–352.

<sup>25</sup> This author states (p. 151, n. 2) that he is in the process of elaborating a bio-bibliographical dictionary of non-Muslim authors in the Ottoman Empire, which presumably includes Greek-Orthodox writers.

den Boogert). This should come as an encouragement for future research to focus on the role of the Greek-Orthodox in Ottoman lands as mediators, envoys, and negotiators at the Sultan's court, especially in consideration of their great numbers in the office of dragoman.<sup>26</sup>

Most of the papers are accompanied by archive illustrations, maps and photos, adding to the overall interest of this text collection: ship papers dated 1763, issued in Smyrna, vintage pictures of Cairo palaces and mansions, documents and photos from the private archives of the families mentioned, etc. The closing Index of geographical names and Index of cited persons come as a rare luxury, for a collective volume.

It is worth noting that several of the authors accomplished their research projects, whose results are presented here, under the supervision of Bernard Heyberger, a true mentor for the younger generation of scholars dedicated to the study of communities situated on the fringes of Muslim lands and the interaction between Muslims and Christians. His encouragement to a close look at fundamental sources is noticeable in the large amount of data collected by most authors present here from the historical archives of Rome, Aleppo, Damascus, Cairo, etc. A Director of the Institut d'études de l'Islam et des sociétés du monde musulman (IISMM) in Paris<sup>27</sup>, Bernard Heyberger cannot be commended too highly for relentlessly promoting research in a field that has only recently become attractive to people other than the small community of passionate scholars of Eastern Christianity.

The outcome of this collection of essays is a clearer definition of "mediation" as a trope, in connection with the notion of "foreignness" that pervades most articles: ethnic or religious minorities, under the "protection" of the Ottoman state, second-rank citizens in their native provinces, lacking all sorts of social and political rights, still carried out the important task of connecting the great Empire, with its immense administrative network and trade system, to the Christian peoples of Europe. It is a most welcome book, bringing to the attention of the scholarly public the role of mediators that non-Muslims and minority communities played all through the Ottoman rule. The authors of the collected essays underline two important facts that tend to be overlooked in our media-frenzied times: first, that these communities, groups, and persons significantly contributed to the stability of the Empire and that its fall was, to a great extent, a consequence of their growing discontent; and second, that a lesson for today is to be learned from the life and work of all those who, without adhering to the faith, politics or mentality of the Ottomans, succeeded in co-existing with them for centuries, in conquered lands that were their home. Or, in Sydney Griffith's words: "Now it is time for Westerners to consider the lessons to be learned from the experience of the Christians who have lived in the world of Islam for centuries".<sup>28</sup>

Ioana Feodorov

*Relations entre les peuples de l'Europe Orientale et les chrétiens arabes au XVII<sup>e</sup> siècle. Macaire III Ibn al-Za'im et Paul d'Alep*, Actes du I<sup>er</sup> Colloque international, le 16 septembre 2011, Bucarest, textes réunis et présentés par Ioana Feodorov, București, Editura Academiei Române, 2012 (Institut d'Études Sud-Est Européennes de l'Académie Roumaine, Bucarest), 193 p.

Les Actes du colloque organisé à Bucarest en septembre 2011 autour du *Récit du voyage* du patriarche d'Antioche Macaire Ibn al-Za'im, rédigé par son fils, Paul d'Alep (1627–1669), représentent le premier résultat éditorial d'un projet international entamé en 2008 à l'Institut d'Études Sud-Est Européennes de l'Académie Roumaine par notre collègue, Ioana Feodorov, qui réunit des chercheurs de Roumanie, de Russie et d'Ukraine et qui se donne pour objectif l'édition intégrale et la traduction

<sup>26</sup> See Andrei Pippidi, *Quelques drogmans de Constantinople au XVII<sup>e</sup> siècle*, in « Revue des études sud-est européennes », X, 2, 1972, p. 227–255.

<sup>27</sup> Created in 1999, attached to l'École des Hautes Études en Sciences Sociales (EHESS), Paris. On-line at <http://iismm.ehess.fr/index.php>.

<sup>28</sup> Sidney H. Griffith, *The Church in the Shadow of the Mosque. Christians and Muslims in the World of Islam*, Princeton and Oxford, Princeton University Press, 2010, p. 179.